

HOW TO RECITE KEDUSHA

Overview

The Artscroll siddur's instructions state that every other sentence is Kedusha is first recited by the congregation before being chanted by the chazan. I found that all rabbinic authorities who address this issue disagree and rule that **ONLY** the chazan should say the chazan's lines. That is because the chazan's lines merely are to prompt the congregation to say **their** lines. This is for the same reason that in Kadish, the chazan **alone** says his lines and the congregation responds **only** on their line. I compare it to the cheer "hip hip hurray", when the leader yells "hip hip" to prompt the audience to respond with "hurrray", where it would sound ridiculous for the audience to yell "hip hip" before the leader yells "hip hip". Only 3 authorities (**Ba'al Hatanya**¹ and **Vilna Gaon**² and **Taz**³) say it's not bad for the congregation to say the chazan's lines before he does (in Taz's words "Ain shum kpaidah"). And only **Arizal** actually states it is **good** for the congregation to say the chazan's lines, and even he Arizal (per **Magen Avraham**, **Sha'arai Tshuva**, and **Kaf Hachayim**) doesn't suggest saying the chazan's lines **BEFORE** the chazzan recites them but only word-per-word **WITH** the chazzan. It appears that no authority recommends saying the chazan's lines, as we do, **BEFORE** the chazzan recites them.

Background Details

Tur does not address this. But Chulchan Aruch 125:1 states that **ONLY** the chazan should say it, and **Eteres Zkainim** there quotes the **Rash Shailos V'tshuvos** as agreeing. **Machatzis Hashekel**⁴ there agrees. **Mishna Brurah** there (including in his **Be'ur Halacha** there and greatly quoting the **B'er Haitaiv**) agrees, and states that this rule applies also to Kadish, and explains that it is because the chazan is acting as our representative. **Mishna Brurah's Be'ur Halacha** there cites **Shulchan Aruch Hagraz** and **Gra** as both holding that even though a congregation **MAY** recite the chazan's passages, it is better not to. But **Taz** there, in sif katan 1, says that he doesn't see any harm in a congregant actually saying the chazan's passages. **Beur Halacha** there indicates that the only authority that states it is **GOOD** for the congregation to recite the chazan's passages is the Arizal as cited in **Chayai Adam**, but I (Mitchell) looked in **Chayai Adam**, klal 30, siman 9 which discusses this and there **Chayai Adam** neither cites **Arizal** nor suggests that anyone thinks it's a good idea for the congregation to say it, but instead states the congregation should **NOT** say it. The **Chayai Adam**, like the **Mishna Brura**, does acknowledge that the general custom **IS** for the congregation to say it. **Yilkot Yosef** (by Ovadiah Yosef's son **Yitzchak Yosef**) Orech Chaim, siman 125, sif katan 1 cites **Tshuvat HaRash** klal 4, siman 19 and also **Bes Yosef** and **Shulchan Aruch** that the congregation should not recite say (with the chazzan) **Nakdishach**. But cites the **Mordechai** sif katn 2 that permits it, and further quotes **Arizal** in **Sha'ar Hakavanos** page 39 that the congregants **SHOULD** recite it word-by-word with the chazzan. **Lvush Hat'cheles** of **Lvush Malchus** (by Mordechai Yaffa), Orech Chaim, siman 125, states the congregation should not say "Nekadesh ..." or "Na'aritzach...", and that **Eliya Zuta** and **Mhr'n Azulai** agree. but that **Sefer Chasidim**, 809, seems to indicate the congregation should recite it quietly. **Aruch Hashulchan** Orech Chaim siman 125 sif 2 states it is **OK** for congregants to say **Nakdishach** with the chazzan but better not to because the chazzan is prompting us; just like we don't recite **Kadish** with the chazzan in which the chazzan is prompting us to chant "Yehai shmai raba...."

Piskei Tshuvos⁵ cites the Gra's **Ma'asei Rav** 44 as recommending **NOT** to recite chazan's passages. **Piskei Tshuvos** cites Piskai Chasam Sofer, Ose 28, as holding **NOT** to say the chazan's passages. **Piskei Tshuvos** cites **Nezios Shimshon** as holding **TO** say chazzan's passages. **Piskei Tshuvos** cites Rabbi Akiva Eger who cites Aruch Hashulchan, sif 2, as recommending **TO** say the chazan's passage **Nkadesh** but **NOT** to say the chazan's other passages (l'umasam baruch yomairu, etc) but I, Mitchell, read **Aruch Hashulchan** as saying others (see above). **Piskei Tshuvos** cites **Magen Avraham** sif katan 2, **Sha'arai Tshuva** sif katan 1, and **Kaf Hachayim** kif katan 2 as recommending to say the chazan's passages word by word with the chazzan.

The above relates only to what the **congregation** should say. However, regarding what the **chazzan** should say: **Yilkot Yosef** (by Ovadiah Yosef's son **Yitzchak Yosef**) Orech Chaim, siman 125, sif katan 2, cites **ShUT Divrai Yosef** siman 13 that in **Kedusha**, the chazzan should recite the sentences of "kadosh kadosh ..." and "baruch kvod ..." in unison with the congregation, but also cites **ShUT Beis Yehuda** chelek 2 siman 3 who states the chazzan **may instead** recite it by himself because he is doing it for those congregants who can't recite it themselves.

¹ Shulchan Aruch HaGraz by Shneur Zalman of Liadi, (1745-1812) Lithuania, aka Shneur Zalman Baruchovitch, RaZaSh, Baal HaTanya, the Alter Rebbe, Rabbeinu HaZokein, Rabbeinu HaGodol, GRaZ. wrote Shulchan Aruch HaRav and Tanya

² Vilna Gaon (1720-1797) Lithuania

³ Turai Zahav 1586 – 1667)

⁴ Machatzis Hashekel; Rav Shmuel ben Natan Neta HaLevi was born in 1738

⁵ Piskei Tshuvos by Simcha BenTzion Rabinovitch who currently lives in Ramat Shlomo neighborhood of Jerusalem)